

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION
COMBINED CONSENSUS SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description	Pierce College - Olympic South Building Restoration
Project Number	2021-192
Name of Selection Panel Chair	Dennis Flynn

PHASE 1 STATEMENTS OF QUALIFICATIONS		Date: 10/3/2022						Number of Submitting Firms: 5	
Firms	PHASE 1 TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORES OF PANEL MEMBERS							TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	RANK ORDER
	Dennis Flynn	Chris Gizzi	Charlene Wilson	Gus Lim	Gregg Middaugh	Financial Capacity			
	Total Weighted	Total Weighted	Total Weighted	Total Weighted	Total Weighted	Pass/Fail			
1 FORMA + McGranahan	86.25	78.75	95.30	95.50	90.35	Pass		446.15	1
2 PCL + ehdd	74.30	79.25	75.25	92.00	85.85	Pass		406.65	5
3 Neeley + Erickson McGovern	81.55	77.75	81.80	79.00	88.75	Pass		408.85	4
4 Absher + Integrus	89.70	79.75	81.85	90.75	90.70	Pass		432.75	2
5 GLY + SHKS	83.50	77.50	82.20	96.00	83.40	Pass		422.60	3
6									
7									
8									
9									
10									
11									
12									
13									
14									
15									
16									
17									
18									

SHORT LISTED FIRMS		Date: 12/9/2022						Number of Firms Interviewed: 3	
Firms	PHASE ONE SCORES FOR SHOR LISTED FIRMS							TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	
	Dennis Flynn	Chris Gizzi	Charlene Wilson	Gus Lim	Gregg Middaugh				
1 Absher + Integrus	89.70	79.75	81.85	90.75	90.70			432.75	
2 Forma + McGranahan	86.25	78.75	95.30	95.50	90.35			446.15	
3 GLY + SHKS	83.50	77.50	82.20	96.00	83.40			422.60	
4									

FULL PROCUREMENT		TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORES OF PANEL MEMBERS						TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	FINAL RANK ORDER
Firms	Dennis Flynn	Chris Gizzi	Charlene Wilson	Gus Lim	Gregg Middaugh				
1 Absher + Integrus	95.1	86.35	89.63	84.78	89.33			445.15	2
2 Forma + McGranahan	87.9	88.39	97.41	88.66	88.63			451.03	1
3 GLY + SHKS	74.3	81.60	77.88	77.50	76.68			387.93	3
4									

SELECTION PANEL REACHED CONSENSUS:

Dennis Flynn

Dennis Flynn

ps

Charlene Wilson

G. Middaugh

Gregg Middaugh

CG

Chris Gizzi

R A Lim

Gus Lim



FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES
 DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION
 PHASE I SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Pierce College - Olympic South Building Restoration	
Date of Evaluation 10/3/2022	Project Number 2021-192
Name of Selection Panel Member Dennis Flynn	

CRITERIA	Team Organization		Demonstrated Experience		Design Mgmt. & Excellence		Project Controls		DB Construction Experience		TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE	
	Scores	Score	25	Score	15	Score	20	Score	15	Score		25
1 FORMA + McGranahan		97%	24.25	93%	13.95	73%	14.60	73%	10.95	90%	22.50	86.25
2 PCL + ehdd		92%	23.00	98%	14.70	61%	12.20	61%	9.15	61%	15.25	74.30
3 Neeley + Erickson McGovern		61%	15.25	94%	14.10	81%	16.20	90%	13.50	90%	22.50	81.55
4 Absher + Integrus		87%	21.75	98%	14.70	93%	18.60	81%	12.15	90%	22.50	89.70
5 GLY + SHKS		82%	20.50	89%	13.35	81%	16.20	73%	10.95	90%	22.50	83.50
6												
7												
8												
9												
10												
11												
12												
13												
14												
15												
16												
17												
18												

COMMENTS:

Dennis Flynn

Dennis Flynn

10/3/2022

Date



Washington State Department of

Enterprise Services

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION
PHASE I SCORING SHEET

Project description Pierce College - Olympic South Building Restoration	
Date of Evaluation 10/3/2022	Project Number 2021-192
Name of Selection Panel Member Chris Gizzi	

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

CRITERIA	Team Organization		Demonstrated Experience		Design Mgmt. & Excellence		Project Controls		DB Construction Experience		TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE 100
	Score	25	Score	15	Score	20	Score	15	Score	25	
1 FORMA + McGranahan	75%	18.75	80%	12.00	80%	16.00	80%	12.00	80%	20.00	78.75
2 PCL + ehdd	80%	20.00	85%	12.75	75%	15.00	85%	12.75	75%	18.75	79.25
3 Neeley + Erickson McGovern	80%	20.00	75%	11.25	80%	16.00	70%	10.50	80%	20.00	77.75
4 Absher + Integrus	75%	18.75	80%	12.00	85%	17.00	80%	12.00	80%	20.00	79.75
5 GLY + SHKS	85%	21.25	75%	11.25	75%	15.00	75%	11.25	75%	18.75	77.50
6											
7											
8											
9											
10											
11											
12											
13											
14											
15											
16											
17											
18											

COMMENTS:

Chris Gizzi

10/3/2022
Date



Washington State Department of

Enterprise Services

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION

PHASE I SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Pierce College - Olympic South Building Restoration	
Date of Evaluation 10/3/2022	Project Number 2021-192
Name of Selection Panel Member Charlene Wilson	

CRITERIA	Team Organization		Demonstrated Experience		Design Mgmt. & Excellence		Project Controls		DB Construction Experience		TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE
	Score	25	Score	15	Score	20	Score	15	Score	25	
1 FORMA + McGranahan	95%	23.75	100%	15.00	96%	19.20	99%	14.85	90%	22.50	95.30
2 PCL + ehdd	70%	17.50	75%	11.25	75%	15.00	75%	11.25	81%	20.25	75.25
3 Neeley + Erickson McGovern	82%	20.50	82%	12.30	85%	17.00	80%	12.00	80%	20.00	81.80
4 Absher + Integrus	81%	20.25	81%	12.15	81%	16.20	80%	12.00	85%	21.25	81.85
5 GLY + SHKS	85%	21.25	85%	12.75	81%	16.20	80%	12.00	80%	20.00	82.20
6											
7											
8											
9											
10											
11											
12											
13											
14											
15											
16											
17											
18											

COMMENTS:

Charlene Wilson

10/3/2022
Date



Washington State Department of

Enterprise Services

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION

PHASE I SCORING SHEET

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Pierce College - Olympic South Building Restoration	
Date of Evaluation 10/3/2022	Project Number 2021-192
Name of Selection Panel Member Gus Lim	

CRITERIA	Team Organization		Demonstrated Experience		Design Mgmt. & Excellence		Project Controls		DB Construction Experience		TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE 100
	Score	25	Score	15	Score	20	Score	15	Score	25	
1 FORMA + McGranahan	100%	25.00	100%	15.00	100%	20.00	70%	10.50	100%	25.00	95.50
2 PCL + ehdd	100%	25.00	90%	13.50	80%	16.00	100%	15.00	90%	22.50	92.00
3 Neeley + Erickson McGovern	70%	17.50	90%	13.50	80%	16.00	80%	12.00	80%	20.00	79.00
4 Absher + Integrus	85%	21.25	100%	15.00	100%	20.00	80%	12.00	90%	22.50	90.75
5 GLY + SHKS	100%	25.00	100%	15.00	100%	20.00	90%	13.50	90%	22.50	96.00
6											
7											
8											
9											
10											
11											
12											
13											
14											
15											
16											
17											
18											

COMMENTS:

R A Lim

Gus Lim

10/3/2022

Date



Washington State Department of

Enterprise Services

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION

PHASE I SCORING SHEET

Project description Pierce College - Olympic South Building Restoration	
Date of Evaluation 10/3/2022	Project Number 2021-192
Name of Selection Panel Member Gregg Middaugh	

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

CRITERIA	Team Organization		Demonstrated Experience		Design Mgmt. & Excellence		Project Controls		DB Construction Experience		TOTAL WEIGHTED SCORE 100
	Score	25	Score	15	Score	20	Score	15	Score	25	
1 FORMA + McGranahan	95%	23.75	90%	13.50	88%	17.60	90%	13.50	88%	22.00	90.35
2 PCL + ehdd	90%	22.50	85%	12.75	83%	16.60	85%	12.75	85%	21.25	85.85
3 Neeley + Erickson McGovern	85%	21.25	90%	13.50	90%	18.00	90%	13.50	90%	22.50	88.75
4 Absher + Integrus	95%	23.75	93%	13.95	85%	17.00	90%	13.50	90%	22.50	90.70
5 GLY + SHKS	81%	20.25	81%	12.15	85%	17.00	85%	12.75	85%	21.25	83.40
6											
7											
8											
9											
10											
11											
12											
13											
14											
15											
16											
17											
18											

COMMENTS:

Gregg Middaugh

10/3/2022
Date

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION
 PHASE II SCORING & FULL PROCUREMENT

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Pierce College - Olympic South Building Restoration	
Date of Evaluation 12/9/2022	Project Number 2021-192
Name of Selection Panel Member Dennis Flynn	

PROPOSAL SCORING CRITERIA	Weighting	Absher + Integrus		Forma + McGranahan		GLY + SHKS	
		Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
Overall Management Approach	25	95%	23.75	80%	20.00	80%	20.00
Design Development and Management	20	95%	19.00	95%	19.00	80%	16.00
GMP Development Plan	25	95%	23.75	95%	23.75	70%	17.50
Project Sequencing and Scheduling	20	100%	20.00	100%	20.00	70%	14.00
Safety	10	100%	10.00	80%	8.00	100%	10.00
Phase 1 Level of Effort (Yes/No)	Pass/Fail	Pass		Pass		Pass	
Diverse Business Inclusion Plan (Yes/No)	Pass/Fail	Pass		Pass		Pass	
TOTAL PROPOSAL SCORE (Weighted)	100		96.50		90.75		77.50
FULL PROCUREMENT							
1. SOQ (Phase 1)	20	89.70%	17.94	86.25%	17.25	83.50%	16.70
2. PROPRIETARY MEETING (Phase 2)	30	100%	30.00	80%	24.00	70%	21.00
3. PROPOSAL (Phase 2)	25	96.50%	24.13	90.75%	22.69	77.50%	19.38
4. INTERVIEW	20	100%	20.00	95%	19.00	61%	12.20
SUBTOTAL SCORES	95		92.07		82.94		69.28
PRICE FACTOR (5% of weighted score)	5	5.85	3	4.50	5	4.50	5
Lowest Price Factor	4.50						
TOTAL SCORES	100		95.07		87.94		74.28

Dennis Flynn

Committee Member's Signature

COMMENTS:

--

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION
PHASE II SCORING & FULL PROCUREMENT

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Pierce College - Olympic South Building Restoration	
Date of Evaluation 12/9/2022	Project Number 2021-192
Name of Selection Panel Member Chris Gizzi	

PROPOSAL SCORING CRITERIA	Weighting	Absher + Integrus		Forma + McGranahan		GLY + SHKS	
		Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
Overall Management Approach	25	86%	21.50	85%	21.25	82%	20.50
Design Development and Management	20	90%	18.00	90%	18.00	75%	15.00
GMP Development Plan	25	82%	20.50	90%	22.50	80%	20.00
Project Sequencing and Scheduling	20	92%	18.40	92%	18.40	85%	17.00
Safety	10	88%	8.80	88%	8.80	87%	8.70
TOTAL PROPOSAL SCORE (Weighted)	100		87.20		88.95		81.20

FULL PROCUREMENT							
1. SOQ (Phase 1)	20	79.75%	15.95	78.75%	15.75	77.50%	15.50
2. PROPRIETARY MEETING (Phase 2)	30	92%	27.60	90%	27.00	82%	24.60
3. PROPOSAL (Phase 2)	25	87.20%	21.80	88.95%	22.24	81.20%	20.30
4. INTERVIEW	20	90%	18.00	92%	18.40	81%	16.20
SUBTOTAL SCORES	95		83.35		83.39		76.60
PRICE FACTOR (5% of weighted score)	5	5.85	3	4.50	5	4.50	5
Lowest Price Factor	4.50						
TOTAL SCORES	100		86.35		88.39		81.60



Committee Member's Signature

COMMENTS:

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION
PHASE II SCORING & FULL PROCUREMENT

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Pierce College - Olympic South Building Restoration	
Date of Evaluation 12/9/2022	Project Number 2021-192
Name of Selection Panel Member Charlene Wilson	

PROPOSAL SCORING CRITERIA	Weighting	Absher + Integrus		Forma + McGranahan		GLY + SHKS	
		Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score
Overall Management Approach	25	90%	22.50	98%	24.50	80%	20.00
Design Development and Management	20	99%	19.80	100%	20.00	85%	17.00
GMP Development Plan	25	81%	20.25	98%	24.50	81%	20.25
Project Sequencing and Scheduling	20	81%	16.20	100%	20.00	75%	15.00
Safety	10	75%	7.50	100%	10.00	75%	7.50
TOTAL PROPOSAL SCORE (Weighted)	100		86.25		99.00		79.75

FULL PROCUREMENT							
1. SOQ (Phase 1)	20	81.85%	16.37	95.30%	19.06	82.20%	16.44
2. PROPRIETARY MEETING (Phase 2)	30	99%	29.70	96%	28.80	75%	22.50
3. PROPOSAL (Phase 2)	25	86.25%	21.56	99.00%	24.75	79.75%	19.94
4. INTERVIEW	20	95%	19.00	99%	19.80	70%	14.00
SUBTOTAL SCORES	95		86.63		92.41		72.88
PRICE FACTOR (5% of weighted score)	5	5.85	3	4.50	5	4.50	5
Lowest Price Factor	4.50						
TOTAL SCORES	100		89.63		97.41		77.88



Committee Member's Signature

COMMENTS:

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION
 PHASE II SCORING & FULL PROCUREMENT

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Pierce College - Olympic South Building Restoration	
Date of Evaluation 12/9/2022	Project Number 2021-192
Name of Selection Panel Member Gus Lim	

PROPOSAL SCORING CRITERIA	Weighting	Absher + Integrus		Forma + McGranahan		GLY + SHKS	
		Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score
Overall Management Approach	25	95%	23.75	95%	23.75	95%	23.75
Design Development and Management	20	80%	16.00	75%	15.00	65%	13.00
GMP Development Plan	25	95%	23.75	100%	25.00	85%	21.25
Project Sequencing and Scheduling	20	95%	19.00	100%	20.00	60%	12.00
Safety	10	100%	10.00	85%	8.50	100%	10.00
TOTAL PROPOSAL SCORE (Weighted)	100		92.50		92.25		80.00

FULL PROCUREMENT							
1. SOQ (Phase 1)	20	90.75%	18.15	95.50%	19.10	96.00%	19.20
2. PROPRIETARY MEETING (Phase 2)	30	75%	22.50	75%	22.50	61%	18.30
3. PROPOSAL (Phase 2)	25	92.50%	23.13	92.25%	23.06	80.00%	20.00
4. INTERVIEW	20	90%	18.00	95%	19.00	75%	15.00
SUBTOTAL SCORES	95		81.78		83.66		72.50
PRICE FACTOR (5% of weighted score)	5	5.85	3	4.50	5	4.50	5
Lowest Price Factor	4.50						
TOTAL SCORES	100		84.78		88.66		77.50

R A Lim

 Committee Member's Signature

COMMENTS:

FACILITY PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

DESIGN BUILDER SELECTION
 PHASE II SCORING & FULL PROCUREMENT

This Scoresheet Becomes Public Record

Project description Pierce College - Olympic South Building Restoration	
Date of Evaluation 12/9/2022	Project Number 2021-192
Name of Selection Panel Member Gregg Middaugh	

PROPOSAL SCORING CRITERIA	Weighting	Absher + Integrus		Forma + McGranahan		GLY + SHKS	
		Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score	Raw Score	Weighted Score
Overall Management Approach	25	90%	22.50	85%	21.25	80%	20.00
Design Development and Management	20	90%	18.00	85%	17.00	80%	16.00
GMP Development Plan	25	85%	21.25	90%	22.50	80%	20.00
Project Sequencing and Scheduling	20	90%	18.00	90%	18.00	75%	15.00
Safety	10	90%	9.00	95%	9.50	70%	7.00
TOTAL PROPOSAL SCORE (Weighted)	100		88.75		88.25		78.00

FULL PROCUREMENT							
1. SOQ (Phase 1)	20	90.70%	18.14	90.35%	18.07	83.40%	16.68
2. PROPRIETARY MEETING (Phase 2)	30	90%	27.00	85%	25.50	75%	22.50
3. PROPOSAL (Phase 2)	25	88.75%	22.19	88.25%	22.06	78.00%	19.50
4. INTERVIEW	20	95%	19.00	90%	18.00	65%	13.00
SUBTOTAL SCORES	95		86.33		83.63		71.68
PRICE FACTOR (5% of weighted score)	5	5.85	3	4.50	5	4.50	5
Lowest Price Factor	4.50						
TOTAL SCORES	100		89.33		88.63		76.68



Committee Member's Signature

COMMENTS:












2021-192-Scoresheet


Final Audit Report

2022-12-12

Created:	2022-12-12
By:	Angeline Ernst (angeline.ernst@des.wa.gov)
Status:	Signed
Transaction ID:	CBJCHBCAABAAEzke9bvTqA4eyMmFU18kSByq994btoA7

"2021-192-Scoresheet" History


-  Document created by Angeline Ernst (angeline.ernst@des.wa.gov)
2022-12-12 - 8:54:51 PM GMT- IP address: 198.238.242.30
-  Document emailed to Dennis Flynn (dennis.flynn@des.wa.gov) for signature
2022-12-12 - 8:58:28 PM GMT
-  Document emailed to chris.gizzi@des.wa.gov for signature
2022-12-12 - 8:58:28 PM GMT
-  Document emailed to rlim@pierce.ctc.edu for signature
2022-12-12 - 8:58:29 PM GMT
-  Document emailed to charlene wilson (charlene@cwcpm.com) for signature
2022-12-12 - 8:58:29 PM GMT
-  Document emailed to Gregg Middaugh (gregg.middaugh@pbsusa.com) for signature
2022-12-12 - 8:58:29 PM GMT
-  Email viewed by charlene wilson (charlene@cwcpm.com)
2022-12-12 - 9:10:08 PM GMT- IP address: 24.18.174.132
-  Email viewed by Dennis Flynn (dennis.flynn@des.wa.gov)
2022-12-12 - 9:11:19 PM GMT- IP address: 104.47.64.254
-  Document e-signed by Dennis Flynn (dennis.flynn@des.wa.gov)
Signature Date: 2022-12-12 - 9:11:40 PM GMT - Time Source: server- IP address: 198.238.242.30
-  Document e-signed by charlene wilson (charlene@cwcpm.com)
Signature Date: 2022-12-12 - 9:13:47 PM GMT - Time Source: server- IP address: 24.18.174.132
-  Email viewed by chris.gizzi@des.wa.gov
2022-12-12 - 9:22:13 PM GMT- IP address: 104.47.65.254

 Signer chris.gizzi@des.wa.gov entered name at signing as Chris Gizzi


2022-12-12 - 9:24:46 PM GMT- IP address: 198.238.242.30

 Document e-signed by Chris Gizzi (chris.gizzi@des.wa.gov)

Signature Date: 2022-12-12 - 9:24:48 PM GMT - Time Source: server- IP address: 198.238.242.30

 Email viewed by rlim@pierce.ctc.edu


2022-12-12 - 9:53:18 PM GMT- IP address: 134.39.119.161

 Signer rlim@pierce.ctc.edu entered name at signing as R. Augustus Lim


2022-12-12 - 9:56:54 PM GMT- IP address: 134.39.119.161

 Document e-signed by R. Augustus Lim (rlim@pierce.ctc.edu)

Signature Date: 2022-12-12 - 9:56:56 PM GMT - Time Source: server- IP address: 134.39.119.161

 Email viewed by Gregg Middaugh (gregg.middaugh@pbsusa.com)

2022-12-12 - 10:52:35 PM GMT- IP address: 50.197.67.201

 Document e-signed by Gregg Middaugh (gregg.middaugh@pbsusa.com)

Signature Date: 2022-12-12 - 11:09:57 PM GMT - Time Source: server- IP address: 50.197.67.201

 Agreement completed.

2022-12-12 - 11:09:57 PM GMT